CENTER FOR NEW YORK CITY AFFAIRS
NEW SCHOOL FOR SOCIAL RESEARCH
OCTOBER 23, 1973

"THE ECONOMIC FUTURE OF NEW YORK CITY: A POINT OF VIEW"

BY DANIEL ROSE

ANYONE RASH ENOUGH TO MAKE FIRM PREDICTIONS ABOUT THE FUTURE OF NEW YORK OPENS HIMSELF TO COMPARISON WITH THE LITTLE GIRL WHO ASKED HER SUNDAY SCHOOL TEACHER FOR PERMISSION TO SPEND THE MORNING DRAWING A PICTURE OF GOD. WHEN TOLD GENTLY THAT NO ONE KNEW WHAT GOD LOOKED LIKE, SHE REPLIED, "THEY WILL, WHEN I'VE FINISHED MY PICTURE."

IN CONSIDERING THE NEW YORK OF TOMMORROW, ONE IS FACED WITH SO MANY UNKNOWNS AND EVEN MORE "UNKNOWABLES", SO MANY EDDIES AND CROSS-CURRENTS OF SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DECAY ON THE ONE HAND, AND INDICATIONS OF VITAL GROWTH ON THE OTHER, THAT IT IS DIFFICULT TO PUT THE DATA INTO ANY COHERENT PERSPECTIVE.

THE GREAT MAJORITY OF COMMENTARIES WE HEAR OR READ THAT LOOK TO THE FUTURE DIVIDE INTO TWO SOMEWHAT SIMPLISTIC GROUPS -- THOSE THAT MERELY EXTRAPOLATE ALL RECENT INDICES OF DECLINE AND THEN CONFIDENTLY PREDICT ARMAGEDDON

BY 19XX, AND THOSE TAKING THEIR CUE FROM DR. COUÉ ("EVERY DAY IN EVERY WAY I AM GETTING BETTER AND BETTER") WHO IMPLY THAT IF WE "TALK UP" THE CITY SUFFICIENTLY ALL OUR PROBLEMS WILL SOMEHOW RESOLVE THEMSELVES.

TONIGHT, LET'S TAKE A SOMEWHAT DIFFERENT APPROACH; STARTING WITH THE "GOLDEN AGE" OF NEW YORK AS A BASE LINE, LET US THEN ANALYZE JUST WHAT HAPPENED NEXT.

SUCH AN ANALYSIS WOULD SEEM TO SHOW SOME FORCES OF DECLINE THAT ARE ALREADY REVERSING THEMSELVES, SOME THAT APPEAR TO BE PEAKING OUT, SOME THAT ARE HERE TO STAY AND MUST BE ADJUSTED TO, AND SOME THAT ARE STILL UNKNOWNS WHOSE RESOLUTION WE MUST GUESS AT BLINDLY.

PROJECTED FORWARD, SUCH AN ANALYSIS WOULD SEEM TO SHOW A NEW YORK MOVING MORE OR LESS "SIDEWAYS" FOR THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS BUT HEADING INTO THE 1980'S WITH LESS MANUFACTURING, BUT STILL MORE SERVICES AND PAPERWORK, A POPULATION THAT IS PROBABLY SMALLER NUMERICALLY, BUT ONE THAT IS BETTER EDUCATED, MORE HIGHLY SKILLED AND BETTER PAID; THE CITY WOULD BE SAFER, CLEANER AND MORE AGREEABLE TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC IN VIRTUALLY EVERY WAY, LESS UNIQUE AND CERTAINLY LESS ARROGANT ABOUT ITS SPECIAL QUALITIES, BUT ON BALANCE FOR MOST OF US A MUCH MORE DESIRABLE PLACE IN WHICH TO LIVE, WORK AND

PLAY THAN IT IS TODAY.

BUT LET'S START AT THE BEGINNING.

OPINIONS MAY VARY ABOUT THE SPECIFIC DATES, BUT MY OWN GUESS IS THAT THE 1950'S, OR MORE SPECIFICALLY THE PERIOD FROM 1955 TO 1960, WILL EVENTUALLY BE CONSIDERED NEW YORK'S "AUGUSTAN AGE". AMERICA SET THE PACE FOR THE WORLD, AND NEW YORK SET THE PACE FOR AMERICA. IN ARCHITECTURE, LEVER HOUSE, THE SEAGRAM BUILDING, THE GUGGENHEIM, AND THE RECENTLY COMPLETED U.N. COMPLEX ALL SET STANDARDS FOR THE HINTERLANDS. IN ART, THE WORK OF POLLOCK, ROTHKO, KLINE, GOTTLIEB AND OTHERS OF THE "NEW YORK SCHOOL" OF PAINTING LET SCANDALIZED OLD MEN THROUGHOUT THE WORLD SAY THAT THEIR GRANDCHILDREN COULD DO BETTER, BUT EVERYONE KNEW WHERE THE "SCANDAL" WAS BEING PERPETRATED: IN THE THEATRE, BROADWAY <u>WAS</u> THE AMERICAN STAGE EXCEPT FOR "OFF-BROADWAY" WHICH WAS BOTH CHEAPER AND MORE EXCITING; IN DIPLOMACY, THE U.N. WAS "WHERE IT WAS AT"; AND IN OPERA, IT SEEMED LOGICAL TO REWARD RUDOLF BING'S EXCELLENT JOB AT THE THEN-INNOVATIVE EDINBURGH FESTIVAL WITH THE BIGGEST PLUM OF ALL, DIRECTORSHIP OF THE METROPOLITAN OPERA. ALL OVER AMERICA, MILLIONS WERE DISCOVERING THE APPEAL OF EUROPEAN TRAVEL BUT ON THE WAY OVER OR BACK WOULD STOP TO SHOP AT TIFFANY'S, CARTIER, OR SAKS FIFTH AVENUE. FOR YEARS, THE WORLD KNEW

THE "CODE WORD" MEANINGS OF "WALL STREET", "PARK AVENUE" OR "FIFTH AVENUE", AND IN THE '50'S THE FIELD OF PUBLIC RELATIONS FINALLY BROUGHT "MADISON AVENUE" INTO THE LANGUAGE AS MORE THAN MERELY A GEOGRAPHIC DESCRIPTION. EVEN IN GASTRONOMY, NEW YORK ATTRACTED AN INTERNATIONAL CLIENTELE WHO CAME TO SOULÉ'S LE PAVILLON FOR THE FINEST OF THE OLD OR THE FOUR SEASONS FOR THE BEST OF THE NEW.

TALLYRAND, WHO ONCE OBSERVED THAT ONLY THOSE FAMILIAR WITH PRE-REVOLUTIONARY PARIS COULD TRULY KNOW HOW DELICIOUS LIFE COULD BE, MIGHT HAVE FELT AT HOME IN THE NEW YORK OF THE 1950'S.

IT IS DIFFICULT TO QUANTIFY ACCURATELY SOMETHING AS INTANGIBLE AS SENTIMENT, BUT PERHAPS AS GOOD AN INDICATION AS ANY WOULD BE THE ATTITUDES OF CORPORATE JUNIOR EXECUTIVES BEING TRANSFERRED INTO AND OUT OF THE CITY IN THOSE DAYS. A TYPICAL MIDDLE-LEVEL OFFICER WOULD OFTEN BE WILLING TO FOREGO A RAISE IN ORDER TO GET TRANSFERRED FROM-OUT-OF TOWN TO THE NEW YORK OFFICE; TODAY, HE WOULD MOST LIKELY DEMAND SOMETHING AKIN TO "HAZARDOUS DUTY PAY" TO ENTICE HIM, OR MIGHT EVEN HAVE TO TURN DOWN A PROMOTION BECAUSE HIS WIFE FLATLY REFUSED TO LIVE IN WHAT SHE MIGHT THINK OF AS THE MODERN "SODOM & GOMORRAH".

THE MAJOR DEVELOPMENTS THAT CAUSED SUCH A TURN-ABOUT REALLY ARE THE KEY TO OUR ANALYSIS; THEY, AND NOT THE SYMPTOMS BY WHICH THEY REVEAL THEMSELVES, SHOULD BE THE FOCUS OF OUR ATTENTION.

THE POWERFUL NEGATIVE FORCES THAT HAVE ACTED UPON NEW YORK IN THE LAST TWO DECADES OR SO ARE ESSENTIALLY FIVE IN NUMBER; THEY HAVE BEEN 1) DRAMATIC DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGE, 2) THE NATIONWIDE TREND TOWARD SUBURBANIZATION, 3) IMPORTANT TECHNOLOGICAL CHANGE, 4) MASSIVE ECONOMIC COMPETITION FOR THE NORTHEASTERN REGION FROM OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY, AND 5) THE UNFORTUNATE ATTITUDES AND POLICIES OF GOVERNMENT -- FEDERAL, STATE AND LOCAL.

I - <u>DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGE</u> - IN THE PERIOD FROM 1940 TO 1960 AN INTERESTING PHENOMENON OCCURRED IN THE MISSISSIPPI DELTA: OVER <u>90%</u> OF THE AGRICULTURAL POPULATION LEFT THE AREA BECAUSE OF GROWING MECHANIZATION ON THE FARMS. (OF COURSE, IF WE HADN'T MECHANIZED AGRICULTURE AND KRUSHCHEV HAD, WE WOULD NOW BE DEPENDENT ON THE RUSSIANS FOR FOOD, INSTEAD OF THE REVERSE, BUT IN ANY CASE WE DID). AND THE DISLOCATED POPULATION FROM THERE AND ELSEWHERE IN THE SOUTH AND PUERTO RICO STREAMED NORTH IN SEARCH OF A BETTER LIFE.

ALL OF THE MAJOR OLDER CITIES OF THE NORTH FELT

THE IMPACT SOMEWHAT, BUT THE NEW YORK METROPOLITAN AREA ATTRACTED BY FAR THE LARGEST NUMBERS.

THE MOST OBVIOUS AND LEAST SOPHISTICATED WAY TO VIEW THIS PROBLEM IS TO NOTE THAT IN THE LAST 2 DECADES NEW YORK CITY HAS LOST OVER A MILLION WHITES AND GAINED OVER A MILLION BLACKS AND PUERTO RICANS. A SOMEWHAT MORE THOUGHTFUL BUT STILL INADEQUATE WAY OF LOOKING AT IT IS TO SAY THAT NEW YORK HAS LOST X "TAX PAYERS" AND GAINED X "TAX-EATERS". BUT THE MOST USEFUL WAY, IT SEEMS TO ME, IS TO NOTE THAT NEW YORK HAS EXPORTED TO ITS SUBURBS BLANK NUMBERS OF MIDDLE CLASS TYPES, WITH THEIR MIDDLE CLASS PSYCHES, MIDDLE CLASS SKILLS AND INCOMES, MIDDLE CLASS TASTES AND PURCHASING POWER; THEY HAVE BEEN REPLACED BY BLANK NUMBERS OF LOWEST CLASS RURAL POOR WHO TEND TO LACK THE SKILLS, ATTITUDES AND LIFE STYLES THAT MAKE FOR SUCCESSFUL ADAPTATION TO A NORTHEASTERN URBAN ENVIRONMENT.

THE ABSOLUTELY AMAZING SUCCESS OF THE 300,000 CUBAN IMMIGRANTS IN THE POST-CASTRO "INVASION" OF MIAMI SHOULD GIVE PAUSE TO THOSE WHO SEE NEW YORK'S EXPERIENCE ONLY IN TERMS OF COLOR, LANGUAGE, GEOGRAPHIC ORIGIN OR WHATEVER.

THE CUBANS BROUGHT WITH THEM NOTHING BUT THEIR MIDDLE CLASS PSYCHES; NOW, A DOZEN YEARS LATER, THEY HAVE

GIVEN NEW VITALITY TO THE REGION, BECOMING BANK PRESIDENTS; COLLEGE PROFESSORS; NEWSPAPER PUBLISHERS; OWNERS OF FLOURISHING DEPARTMENT STORES, RADIO AND TELEVISION STATIONS, AND SO FORTH. AND AS A PROFESSIONAL REAL ESTATE MAN, MAY I NOTE QUIETLY THAT SOME OF THE MOST IMPRESSIVE NEW APARTMENT AND OFFICE BUILDINGS IN THE MIAMI AREA HAVE BEEN DESIGNED, BUILT, FINANCED, RENTED AND MANAGED BY CUBAN-AMERICAN FIRMS.

THE TYPICAL CUBAN CHILD IN MIAMI TODAY IS APT TO HAVE A STRONG SELF IMAGE; HE IS REASONABLY CONFIDENT AS HE LOOKS TOWARD THE FUTURE AND PREPARES FOR IT. HE TENDS TO HAVE A STRONG SENSE OF FAMILY AND OF COMMUNITY AND IS ANXIOUS TO DEVELOP SKILLS THAT REFLECT WELL ON BOTH. IN SHORT, HE IS "ON HIS WAY".

MORE AND MORE OBSERVERS ARE COMING TO THE CONCLUSION THAT FOR SUCCESSFUL ADAPTATION TO TWENTIETH CENTURY URBAN LIFE, A MIDDLE CLASS PSYCHE IS A NECESSITY. WITH IT, LITTLE ELSE SEEMS REQUIRED; WITHOUT IT, NOT MUCH REALLY SEEMS TO HELP.

AND THE BLACKS OF N.Y.C. ARE, TO A FAR GREATER EXTENT THAN IS GENERALLY REALIZED, DEVELOPING MIDDLE CLASS PSYCHES. THE PROCESS IS SLOW AND PAINFUL BUT IT'S REAL. THE BLACK PANTHERS, WITH THEIR "BURN, BABY, BURN" MENTALITY,

ARE ON THEIR WAY INTO THE "WASTE BASKET OF HISTORY"; THE BLACK MUSLIMS, WITH THEIR EMPHASIS ON DISCIPLINE, FRUGALITY AND WORK THAT WOULD HAVE INTRIGUED MAX WEBER, HAVE PROVED MUCH MORE DURABLE.

THE EARNEST, PLODDING N.A.A.C.P. AND URBAN LEAGUE, WITH THEIR RELENTLESS EMPHASIS ON EDUCATION, JOBS AND HOUSING, ARE STILL HERE AND ARE STILL ACCOMPLISHING MORE THAN THEY DARE ADMIT, EVEN TO THEMSELVES.

THE MORE FLAMBOYANT C.O.R.E. AND S.N.I.C. EXTREMISTS HAVE COME AND GONE, WITH LITTLE TO SHOW FOR THEIR EXISTENCE BESIDE A MISGUIDED KOERNER COMMISSION REPORT OF 1967 WHICH MISTAKENLY SAW A NATION ON THE BRINK OF VIOLENT REVOLUTION DUE TO AN EVER-INCREASING GAP BETWEEN BLACK AND WHITE.

THE 1970 CENSUS SHOWED QUITE A DIFFERENT PICTURE: BETWEEN 1960 AND 1970, THE PERCENTAGE OF NON-WHITE FAMILIES EARNING MORE THAN $10,000 (IN CONSTANT DOLLARS) ROSE FROM 13% TO 30%; IN 1960, ONLY 4,000 BLACK WOMEN HAD INCOMES OF $10,000 OR MORE WHILE IN 1970, THE NUMBER WAS WELL OVER 100,000. BETWEEN 1964 AND 1970, THE NUMBER OF BLACKS ENROLLED IN COLLEGE INCREASED 123%. IN TERMS OF EDUCATIONAL ACHIEVEMENT, OF TYPE OF JOB HELD, OF STANDARD OF LIVING, ETC. VIRTUALLY ALL THE SIGNIFICANT STATISTICS SHOW A PEOPLE

ON THE MOVE. MY OWN CHOICE FOR THE MOST REVEALING PAIR OF STATISTICS IS THAT CONCERNING THE ENTERING AND LEAVING OF BLACK WOMEN IN THE LABOR FORCE DURING THE DECADE; OVER HALF THOSE LEAVING WERE DOMESTICS OR HOUSEHOLD WORKERS, WHILE LESS THAN 8% OF THOSE ENTERING WERE. WHAT THAT MEANS IN BASIC ENGLISH IS THAT BY THE LATTER 1970'S IT WILL BE RELATIVELY DIFFICULT TO FIND A BLACK MAID BUT RELATIVELY EASY TO FIND A BLACK SECRETARY.

IF ONE RELATES THAT THOUGHT TO ANOTHER, NAMELY THE CHANGE-OVER OF THE U.S. ECONOMY FROM A PREDOMINANTLY MANUFACTURING AND AGRICULTURAL TO A LARGELY PAPERWORK AND SERVICE ECONOMY, IT SUGGESTS THE POSSIBILITY THAT THE CHILDREN OF THE SOCIAL PROBLEMS OF THE 1960'S ARE LIKELY TO TURN OUT TO BE THE WHITE COLLAR CLERICAL FORCE OF THE 1980'S.

THE PHYSICAL VIOLENCE AND THE VANDALISM, THE TURBULENT INFLUENCE ON THE SCHOOL SYSTEM, THE GENERAL AND OBVIOUS LOWERING OF STANDARDS OF ALL SORTS THROUGHOUT THE CITY THAT WAS QUITE REAL IN THE 60'S AND EARLY 70'S SEEM DESTINED TO LEVEL OUT AND THEN START TO IMPROVE SIGNIFICANTLY AS THE FULL IMPACT OF THE "LEAVENING PROCESS" TAKES HOLD, AND AS MORE AND MORE OF THE DYSFUNCTIONAL LOWER CLASS MOVES INTO WHAT WE THINK OF AS THE MIDDLE CLASS, WITH ITS ATTENDANT VALUES AND LIFE STYLES.

IN THE MEANTIME, HOWEVER, THE PROBLEMS ARE VERY REAL.

ON ANY LIST OF CHARACTERISTICS THAT DISTINGUISH LOWEST CLASS FROM MIDDLE CLASS, AND RURAL FROM URBAN ATTITUDES, REACTION TO PHYSICAL VIOLENCE WOULD RANK HIGH.

THE FORMER ACCEPT VIOLENCE AS A NORMAL PART OF LIFE AND SOMETIMES EVEN DELIBERATELY SEEK IT AS A RELIEF FROM BOREDOM OR AN OPPORTUNITY TO DISPLAY "MACHISMO". MIDDLE CLASS TYPES FLEE FROM IT THEMSELVES, AND DO ANYTHING THEY CAN TO SHIELD THEIR WIVES AND CHILDREN FROM IT, EVEN TO THE EXTENT OF MOVING OUT OF TOWN.

IF TO CLASS AND REGIONAL FACTORS ONE ADDS A PRONOUNCED "YOUTH BULGE" TO THE DEMOGRAPHIC STRUCTURE, AND THEN GIVES THOSE REBELLIOUS, VIOLENCE-PRONE YOUNGSTERS NO ACCEPTABLE WAY TO FILL THEIR TIME AND NO LEGITIMATE WAY TO EARN THE EXPENSIVE GOODS OUR CONSUMER-ORIENTED SOCIETY TENDS TO EQUATE WITH SOCIAL STATUS, WE HAVE NOT ONLY A PROBABILITY OF VIOLENT CRIME ON THE STREETS BUT A VIRTUALLY INEVITABLE PRESSURE FOR IT, AS WELL AS SIMILAR PRESSURE ON THE MIDDLE CLASS TO FLEE IN ORDER TO AVOID BECOMING TARGETS FOR IT.

BUT THE REVERSE IS ALSO TRUE. AS THE "YOUTH BULGE"

MOVES UP THROUGH THE AGE SPECTRUM AND AS A SIGNIFICANT PART OF THE LOWEST CLASS MOVES UP THROUGH THE SOCIAL SPECTRUM, THE TENDENCY TOWARD VIOLENCE SHOULD RECEDE, AS INDEED IT IS DOING RIGHT NOW. ADD TO THAT A CHANGING PUBLIC SENTIMENT THAT NO LONGER LIONIZES A MARK RUDD, A BOBBY SEALE OR AN ABBY HOFFMAN AND ONE THAT REMEMBERS THAT AN EFFECTIVE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM NOT ONLY PREVENTS CRIME BY PUNISHING AND/OR REHABILITATING THE CRIMINAL BUT THAT IT ISOLATES AS WELL (AND NOT FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE CRIMINAL BUT FOR THE PROTECTION OF THE PUBLIC) AND ONE HAS ANOTHER MAJOR STEP TOWARD SAFER STREETS THAT WILL RE-ATTRACT MIDDLE CLASS TYPES.

(THIS VERY WEEK A LOCAL JUDGE DISCHARGED TWO YOUNG APPREHENDED ARSONISTS IF THEY WOULD ONLY "GET OUT OF TOWN", ON THE GROUND THAT JAIL WOULD DO THEM NO GOOD. THE PUBLIC OUTRAGE AND THE JUDGE'S SUBSEQUENT RECONSIDERATION WERE HOPEFUL SIGNS OF AN AROUSED PUBLIC'S CONCERN FOR ITS WELFARE AT LEAST AS MUCH AS FOR THE MALEFACTORS'.)

BUT TIMES ARE CHANGING, AND PRESUMABLY ATTITUDES WILL CHANGE ALONG WITH DEMOGRAPHIC PATTERNS.

II SUBURBANIZATION -- THE SECOND MAJOR DEBILITATING INFLUENCE ON NEW YORK (AND INDEED ON ALL OUR CITIES) WOULD SEEM TO BE THE POST WORLD WAR II NATIONWIDE TREND TOWARD SUBURBANIZATION.

A GREAT MANY THOUGHTFUL AND HIGHLY REGARDED OBSERVERS HAVE COME TO THE CONCLUSION THAT THE HIGH-DENSITY, MIXED-USE CENTRAL CITIES AS WE HAVE KNOWN THEM ARE IMPRACTICAL AND INEFFICIENT AND THAT THEY NO LONGER ANSWER OUR NEEDS OF TODAY. THESE MEN CHALLENGE THE BELIEF THAT MOST PEOPLE WOULD PREFER TO LIVE IN CITIES AND THAT THEY WOULD CHOOSE SUBURBAN LIFE EVEN IF THE CITIES WERE SAFE, ATTRACTIVE AND AGREEABLE AND NO MORE EXPENSIVE THAN ALTERNATIVES. THESE OBSERVERS FEEL THAT THE AUTOMOBILE HAS "LIBERATED" US FROM DEPENDENCE ON THE "OLD" HIGH-DENSITY CITY AND HAS ENCOURAGED US TO BUILD "NEW" LOW DENSITY, DOUGHNUT SHAPED CITIES LIKE LOS ANGELES AND HOUSTON.

I MYSELF FEEL THAT HIGH-DENSITY, UNCONGESTED TORONTO IS MORE APT TO BE THE MODEL FOR THE FUTURE. BUT EVEN IF THESE MEN ARE CORRECT THE RELENTLESS LOGIC OF AN ECOLOGICALLY-MINDED SOCIETY BENT ON CONSERVING RESOURCES WON'T PERMIT ALL OF US THE LUXURY OF LIVING IN DULLSVILLE EVEN IF WE WISH TO.

FOR THE ENDLESSLY SPRAWLING AMERICAN SUBURB IS THE MOST ECONOMICALLY WASTEFUL HUMAN SETTLEMENT KNOWN TO MAN. (EXCUSE ME, A KWAKIUTL INDIAN VILLAGE DURING A POTLACH GOES THEM ONE BETTER!)

Let's take some examples from the Regional Plan Association:

A million square feet of office space in Manhattan (assuming a 50 story building) requires a little over one acre of land, half of it a landscaped plaza, plus the equivalent of one track-mile of subway. In the downtown of a small city (assuming a 25 story building, moderate landscaping and a reasonable garage) it would require five or six acres plus the equivalent of two lane-miles of expressway. A suburban office park of a million feet requires eight lane-miles of expressway, and a site of 80 to 100 acres of which about 25 acres is parking lot.

And think of the total costs of heating, utilities, ground care, repairs, etc. for 100 one-family homes compared to the comparable total costs of a 100 unit multi-family structure.

Today, the United States contains 5.6% of the world's population but consumes over 35% of its annual use of non-renewable resources; I just don't think that the others are going to let us keep getting away with it indefinitely.

HOWEVER, THE SUBURB IS WITH US, AND IT IS STILL MUSHROOMING. LAST YEAR AN ESTIMATED 3,000,000 ACRES OF OPEN LAND (EQUAL TO THE TOTAL AREA OF CONNECTICUT) WERE CONSUMED BY URBANIZATION, VACATION DEVELOPMENTS, STRIP MINING AND HIGHWAYS, AND THE SAME AMOUNT IS SCHEDULED TO GO NEXT YEAR.

MY OWN VIEW IS THAT THE DRAMATIC SUBURBAN GROWTH OF THE LAST 25 YEARS HAS HAD A NUMBER OF CAUSES: OBVIOUSLY, A DESIRE FOR OPEN SPACE AND SCENIC LANDSCAPES, THE SATISFACTION OF OWNING ONE'S OWN HOME AND THE WISH TO AVOID URBAN CONGESTION FIGURED PROMINENTLY. AMONG THE OTHER REASONS, HOWEVER, WERE THE DECLINE IN "QUALITY OF LIFE" OF THE CENTRAL CITY, THE TRUE NEED FOR LOW DENSITY AREAS THAT IN EFFECT <u>SUPPORT</u> THE CENTRAL CITY, AND CERTAINLY NOT LEAST OF ALL, THE INFLUENCES OF MISGUIDED GOVERNMENTAL POLICIES WHOSE CONSCIOUS OR EVEN INADVERTENT EFFECT HAS BEEN TO HURT THE CENTRAL CITY. SUBURBAN LIFE, FOR EXAMPLE, REVOLVES AROUND THE AUTOMOBILE, AND IT IS NO SECRET THAT FEDERAL GOVERNMENT POLICY DISCRIMINATES SEVERELY <u>IN FAVOR</u> OF THE AUTO AND <u>AGAINST</u> ANY OTHER FORM OF TRANSPORTATION. SIMILARLY, FEDERAL TAX DEDUCTIONS FOR MORTGAGE INTEREST AND FOR PROPERTY TAXES PROVIDE A MAJOR SUBSIDY FOR HOMEOWNERS, WHO ARE MOSTLY SUBURBAN, AS OPPOSED TO RENTAL TENANTS, WHO ARE

MOSTLY URBAN. BUT POSSIBLY THE STRONGEST ARTIFICIAL FACTOR IS THE USE OF THE LOCAL PROPERTY TAX TO PROVIDE SERVICES FOR POOR. THE SUBURBS, DOING THEIR BEST TO ZONE OUT THE POOR, OF COURSE ESCAPE THAT BURDEN -- AS IF THE EXTRA COSTS OF SERVING HARLEM OR BEDFORD-STUYVESANT SHOULD BE BORNE BY HOME-OWNERS IN THE FIVE BOROUGHS BUT NOT IN SCARSDALE OR GREAT NECK!

FEAR OF CRIME IN THE STREETS AND LOSS OF CONFIDENCE IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOL SYSTEM ARE OF COURSE POWERFUL FACTORS IN THEMSELVES, <u>BUT EVEN BEFORE THEY BECOME SUCH AND EVEN AFTER THEY NO LONGER ARE</u>, THE POTENTIAL SUBURBANITE REALIZES THAT PUBLIC POLICIES REWARD HIM FOR LIVING IN ONE PLACE AND PENALIZE HIM FOR LIVING IN THE OTHER. THE REAL QUESTION IS WHY SO MANY PEOPLE <u>ARE</u> WILLING TO PUT UP WITH THE PROBLEMS OF THE CITY, AS THEY ARE IN LONDON OR PARIS, TOKYO OR MOSCOW.

IN THE CASE OF MOSCOW, ONE NEEDS AN INTERNAL PASSPORT AND EVIDENCE OF A JOB TO BE <u>PERMITTED</u> TO STAY IN THE CITY; IN LONDON, OFFICE RENTS ARE THREE TO FOUR <u>TIMES</u> THOSE OF NEW YORK FOR COMPARABLE SPACE, REFLECTING STRAIGHT SUPPLY-AND-DEMAND PRESSURES IN A SITUATION WHERE GROWTH IS ARTIFICIALLY RESTRAINED. IN PARIS AND TOKYO, THE CENTRIPETAL FORCES ARE IMMENSE.

THE FACT REMAINS THAT MAJOR CITIES EXERT A MAGNETIC ATTRACTION BECAUSE THEIR VERY DENSITY PROVIDES OPPORTUNITY FOR SPECIALIZATIONS (AS IF THE CONCEPT OF "CRITICAL MASS" NEED BE LIMITED TO NUCLEAR PHYSICS!) AND SPECIALIZATIONS TEND TO FEED ON ONE ANOTHER.

THE ANTI-CITY CROWD USE THE PHRASE "INCIPIENT PATRICIAN" TO DESCRIBE THAT TINY PERCENTAGE OF THE POPULATION THAT PREFERS TO LIVE WITHIN QUICK ACCESS TO A FIRST CLASS ALGERIAN COUSCOUS OR AN INDONESIAN RIJSTAFEL, GOOD BALLET OR ART GALLERIES SHOWING THE BEST OF CONTEMPORARY PAINTINGS. BUT THOSE WITH TOP-FLIGHT LEGAL AND DESIGN SKILLS USUALLY DO, TOO, AND THE ADVERTISING AND ACCOUNTING AND PUBLIC RELATIONS AND ENGINEERING AND MARKETING TALENTS, ALSO. AND THE BIGGEST FIRMS MUST HAVE ACCESS TO THOSE SKILLS AND THE LINKAGES THEY REPRESENT.

IT WAS INTERESTING TO NOTE RECENTLY THAT OF SEVEN MAJOR CORPORATIONS THAT MOVED FROM MANHATTAN, SIX HAD SLIPPED IN THEIR "FORTUNE 500" RANKING OF TOP INDUSTRIAL CORPORATIONS, ONE AS MUCH AS TWELVE PLACES.

BESIDES, <u>IF SAFE</u>, BIG CITIES ARE JUST MORE FUN TO BE IN.

As a school boy, I remember reading in the Communist Manifesto Karl Marx's praise of the bourgeoisie for having erected cities that saved us from "the idiocy of rural life." That might be too strong a term to apply to what goes on one hour from New York, but I wouldn't discard the thought entirely!

The degree to which suburban sprawl may be peaking out in the relatively near future is an interesting speculation, however.

Increasingly tough environmental controls (particularly as regards sewage disposal and utility use) and mounting political opposition to the explosive suburban growth that has characterized the recent past, are becoming widespread. In one state after another, in one township after another, the "gang plank" theory is going into effect. As soon as a family gets aboard, they want to pull up the gang plank after them.

And we have no way of estimating how far it all will go.

III <u>Technological Change</u> - A third major influence affecting the city since the end of World War II has been not only a decline in the relative importance of manufacturing to the national economy, but also a change in the nature of present-day

INDUSTRY. THE CITY'S LONG-TIME SPECIALTY, THE OLD-FASHIONED "LOFT-BUILDING", WHERE RAW MATERIAL WENT IN AT THE TOP AND CAME OUT THE BOTTOM, HAS BEEN SUPPLANTED IN EFFICIENCY BY THE HIGHLY AUTOMATED, SUBURBAN ONE-STORY PLANT WHERE MATERIAL GOES IN ONE END AND IS FORK LIFTED OUT THE OTHER. THE SHEER AVAILABILITY OF LARGE ASSEMBLAGES OF CHEAP LAND IS SOMETHING THAT OLD CITIES CANNOT SUPPLY COMPETITIVELY AT PRESENT; AND WHEN THE URBAN COALITION REPORTED THAT BETWEEN 1965 AND 1970 NEW YORK CITY LOST MORE THAN 13,000 BUSINESSES, DETROIT 3,500 AND PHILADELPHIA 3,000, TECHNOLOGICAL CHANGE WAS PROBABLY THE CHIEF CAUSE. IT IS UNLIKELY TO BE REVERSED SOON, AND MANUFACTURING, BOTH LIGHT AND HEAVY, ARE FOR THE TIME BEING MORE LIKELY TO BE LOCATED OUT OF THE CITIES RATHER THAN IN THEM. THE SOUTH BRONX, BROWNSVILLE, EAST NEW YORK, BEDFORD-STUYVESANT, CENTRAL HARLEM AND OTHER AREAS DEVASTATED BY BLIGHT, DECAY AND EVENTUAL ABANDONMENT WILL AT SOME POINT IN TIME HAVE SUCH LOW POPULATION DENSITIES, HOWEVER, THAT THEY WILL BE RECOGNIZED FOR WHAT THEY ARE -- CLOSE-IN "LAND BANKS" RIPE FOR REDEVELOPMENT THAT MAY WELL TURN OUT TO BE INDUSTRIAL.

IN THE MEANTIME, THE UNSKILLED OR LOW-SKILLED WORKER TENDS TO REMAIN IN THE CITY WHILE THE UNSKILLED OR LOW-SKILLED JOB TENDS TO LEAVE THE CITY. (BLUE COLLAR EMPLOYMENT IN THE CITY DECLINED FROM 946,000 IN 1960 TO 766,000

IN 1970, TO 678,000 IN 1972.) THE MOST OBVIOUS ANSWER, BRINGING THE WORKER TO THE JOB, DEFIES THE LAWS OF SUBURBAN EXCLUSIONARY ZONING AND THE REALITIES OF TRANSPORTATION AVAILABILITY; THE SECOND MOST OBVIOUS ANSWER, KEEPING THE JOB IN THE CITY, SEEMS TO DEFY THE CURRENT LAWS OF INDUSTRIAL ECONOMICS.

MY OWN GUESS IS THAT IN TIME MARKET FORCES IN A GROWING ECONOMY WILL BRING ABOUT AN EQUILIBRIUM BETWEEN JOBS AND WORKERS (HARLEM TODAY HAS ONE-HALF THE POPULATION IT HAD IN 1930). BUT ANOTHER POSSIBILITY IS THAT IF THE ECONOMY DOES NOT GROW ENOUGH, WE AS A SOCIETY MAY MERELY DECIDE TO PAY PEOPLE INDEFINITELY FOR NOT WORKING BECAUSE WE CAN'T PROVIDE JOBS FOR THEM.

IN ANY CASE, THE PRESENT MIS-MATCH BETWEEN LOW SKILL JOBS AND LOW SKILL WORKERS IS A VERY REAL PROBLEM NOT EASILY SOLVED.

IV <u>PROBLEMS OF THE NORTHEAST</u> - THE FOURTH DEBILITATING INFLUENCE ON NEW YORK IS A RELATIVE AND NOT AN ABSOLUTE; IT INVOLVES THE DRAMATIC RISE OF OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY.

BOOMING ATLANTA, HOUSTON AND LOS ANGELES OF THE 1960'S REFLECT THE DAZZLING ECONOMIC GROWTH OF THE GEOGRAPHIC AREAS OF WHICH EACH IS THE RESPECTIVE NERVE CENTER.

In the case of California and the Far West, the period of exuberant development may well be tapering off; certainly many, if not most, Californians are disenchanted with the side-effects and are currently showing it at the voting booth every chance they get.

In the case of the eleven states of the Old Confederacy, the recent economic surge will most likely continue for at least another decade. And surge it has been -- manufacturing jobs, for example, rose there in the last decade by 43%, compared with 15% for the nation as a whole. As for city growth, Houston, for example, had a net immigration of more than 300,000 people, about 55% of its total population increase, including births, in the last ten years.

Due to most unusual circumstances that generally have not been adequately discussed or remarked on, the South's gain has been at a demographic cost to the Northeast in two ways. Because the economic differentials between rich and poor in the South are the most extreme in the nation, at the precise period when a million and a half poor rural blacks were heading north, some two million middle class whites were heading south.

In the case of the South, weak industrial unions, low wage-scales, a warm climate and liberal tax benefits were the original inducements to growth; but growth feeds on growth as the "multiplier effect" goes to work, and it is difficult to predict exactly where it will end.

For the purposes of the present discussion, however, let us merely summarize and say that New York is not the <u>political</u> capital of its country, as London, Paris, Tokyo and Moscow are; it is merely the <u>economic</u> capital. This is due in no small part to its location in what has been the pre-eminent economic region of the nation, and in part its fortunes are tied to the relative well-being of that region.

My own crystal ball is not clear enough to see much past the decade, but certainly for that period and more the Northeast will continue much as it is today.

V <u>Counter-productivity of Recent Government Policy</u>

M.I.T.'s Jay Forrester, in "Urban Dynamics", made the interesting observation that in complex systems, "common sense" solutions are often more harmful than helpful. New York City is certainly one of the more interesting "complex systems" known to man, and Heaven knows that many of the

WELL-INTENTIONED ACTS OF ITS LEADERS HAVE HAD DEVASTATING EFFECTS. LIKE CHARLES II, WHO STARTED OUT WITH A MINOR AILMENT AND ENDED DYING PAINFULLY UNDER THE MINISTRATIONS OF HIS SUCCESSIVE DOCTORS, NEW YORK'S UNAVOIDABLE TROUBLES HAVE BEEN UNNECESSARILY COMPOUNDED.

LET US TAKE HOUSING AS A CASE IN POINT.

RESIDENTIAL RENT CONTROL AS PRACTICED IN NEW YORK SINCE WORLD WAR II HAS BEEN AS EFFECTIVE AS THE FIRE-BOMBING OF DRESDEN. AS TENS OF THOUSANDS OF <u>OCCUPIED</u> HOUSING UNITS HAVE BEEN ABANDONED BY THEIR OWNERS BECAUSE THE ECONOMIC VALUE FELL TO ZERO, OUR POLITICAL SAVANTS VIED WITH ONE ANOTHER TO "PLUG THE LOOP-HOLES IN THE RENT LAWS". WHEN IT LOOKS AS IF "CO-OP" CONVERSION MIGHT POSSIBLY SAVE WHAT REMAINS OF THE GRAND CONCOURSE IN THE BRONX OR OF OCEAN PARK-WAY IN BROOKLYN, OUR LOCAL WISE-MEN STRIVE TO RAISE THE PER-CENTAGE OF MANDATORY TENANT APPROVAL FROM 35% TO 51%; WHEN THE SUBSIDIZED HOUSING PROGRAM KNOWN AS MITCHELL-LAMA SHOWED SIGNS OF SUCCESSFULLY PROVIDING MIDDLE-INCOME HOUSING ON AN ECONOMICALLY SUSTAINABLE BASIS IN AN INFLATIONARY PERIOD, THEY CLAMP A STATUTORY CEILING OF 7 1/2% PER ANNUM ON RENT INCREASES REGARDLESS OF THE ACTUAL FINANCIAL NEEDS OF THE PROJECT; AND WHEN THEY LOOK TO THE PRIVATE SECTOR TO "DO ITS THING" WITH NEW CONSTRUCTION THEY SO HEDGE THE DEVELOPER-BUILDER

WITH UNREALISTIC REGULATIONS AND REQUIREMENTS AS TO DRIVE UP THE COST OF NEW HOUSING BEYOND THE ABILITY OF THE PUBLIC TO PAY FOR IT.

AS WITH HOUSING, SO WITH LABOR NEGOTIATIONS, TRANSPORTATION AND OTHER AREAS OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION. UNREALISTIC EXPECTATIONS OF WHAT A PUBLIC SCHOOL SYSTEM COULD REASONABLY BE EXPECTED TO ACCOMPLISH NEARLY FOUNDERED A BASICALLY SOUND OPERATION, AS DECENTRALIZED INEFFICIENCY REPLACED CENTRALIZED INEFFICIENCY, AND AS AVERAGE READING SCORES WENT DOWN (AND ARE NOW GOING UP AGAIN) FOR QUITE IRRELEVANT REASONS; BUT BLACK/JEWISH RELATIONSHIPS WILL NEVER AGAIN BE QUITE THE SAME AFTER A SOUL-SEARING, TOTALLY UNNECESSARY TEACHER STRIKE.

ALL SAID AND DONE, MANY THINK THAT NEW YORK DESERVED BETTER FROM ITS LEADERSHIP. BUT IN ALL FAIRNESS TO JOHN LINDSAY, THE PROBLEMS WERE IMMENSE, RELEVANT PRECEDENTS WERE FEW, POLITICAL PRESSURES ARE GREAT; A GROWING CONSENSUS FEELS THAT HE LEAVES OFFICE A VERY MUCH BIGGER MAN THAN WHEN HE ENTERED AND THAT IN THE LAST MONTHS OF HIS ADMINISTRATION HE HAS STARTED TO APPLY SUCCESSFULLY THE PAINFUL LESSONS HE ACQUIRED THROUGH THE PRECEDING YEARS.

* * * * *

SPECIFIC CONSTRUCTIVE PROPOSALS FOR THE CLASS TO ATTACK, AS HOMEWORK.

1) ENCOURAGE RATHER THAN DISCOURAGE THE CO-OP CONVERSION OF OLDER RENTAL HOUSING, SO AS TO HELP RESERVE THE BUILDINGS WHILE ALSO "BINDING" POPULATIONS TO NEIGHBORHOODS; GRANT SHORT TERM REAL ESTATE TAX ABATEMENT AND LOW INTEREST CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT LOANS TO SUCH BUILDINGS.

2) SUBSIDIZE MASS TRANSIT, AS IS DONE IN MOST MAJOR CITIES THROUGHOUT THE CIVILZED WORLD (ALONG WITH THE OPERA, BALLET, MUSEUMS, MAJOR LIBRARIES, ETC. WHICH SHOULD NOT HAVE TO BE SELF-SUPPORTING).

3) ENCOURAGE SEVERE ATTITUDES BY POLICE AND COURTS TOWARD PHYSICAL VIOLENCE AND STREET CRIME, ON THE GROUNDS THAT SUCH VIOLENCE IS COMMITTED OVERWHELMING BY A RELATIVELY FEW PEOPLE WHO (A) ARE REPETITIVE; (B) TEND TO BE BETWEEN 15 AND 25 YEARS OF AGE, AND WHO ALMOST INVARIABLY OUTGROW IT AFTER THAT AGE; AND (C) WHO, AFTER ESTABLISHING A PATTERN OF VIOLENT BEHAVIOR SHOULD BE ISOLATED, NOT FOR <u>THEIR</u> BENEFIT BUT FOR <u>OURS</u>.

4) HIGHER MORALE (AND LOWER PAY) TO BE ACHIEVED FOR MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE WORKERS WHO NOW FEEL UNAPPRECIATED

AND SO SEEK (AND RECEIVE) HIGHER WAGES THAN THEIR COUNTERPARTS IN THE CIVILIAN WORLD -- BY DEPARTMENTAL BANDS AND BALL TEAMS, PUBLIC AWARDS AND PRAISE FOR OUTSTANDING PERFORMANCE, ETC.

5) ENCOURAGE CONVERSION OF OLDER "LOFT" BUILDINGS TO OTHER USES (HOUSING, OFFICE, GALLERY, ETC.) BY LIBERAL USE OF TAX ABATEMENT AND LOW INTEREST LOANS.

6) DE-PENALIZE "VICTIMLESS CRIMES" SO THAT THE POLICE CAN CONCENTRATE ON MORE SERIOUS MATTERS AND ALSO BE LESS OPEN TO BRIBERY AND CORRUPTION FOR CLOSING AN EYE TO ACTS THEY REALLY BELIEVE TO BE HARMLESS.

7) INSTITUTE INTENSIVE VOCATIONAL TRAINING PROGRAMS UNDER CLOSE SUPERVISION WHERE THE LEARNER IS PAID BY A GOVERNMENT AGENCY AND WHERE THE EMPLOYER GETS FREE LABOR FOR A WHILE AS AN INDUCEMENT TO TAKE SOMEONE FROM A PRESCRIBED "LABOR POOL".

8) HAVE VARIABLE FARES AND TOLLS (HIGHER DURING RUSH HOURS) SO AS TO ENCOURAGE MORE UNIFORM USE OF FACILITIES.

9) ASSEMBLE ABANDONED SLUM LAND IN LAND BANK FOR EVENTUAL USE AS NEW "IN-CITY" INDUSTRIAL PARKS.

10) INSTITUTE DOWNTOWN MALLS AT NIGHT AND ON WEEKENDS, OR ON EAST/WEST STREETS WHERE FEASIBLE MID-TOWN BUT NOT ON MAJOR NORTH/SOUTH ARTERIES THAT WILL INTENSIFY RUSH-HOUR CONGESTION ELSEWHERE.

11) PROVIDE CHEAP, SAFE, CONVENIENT MUNICIPAL PARKING GARAGES ON THE OUTSKIRTS OF THE WALL STREET AND MID-TOWN AREAS WITH GOOD RAPID TRANSIT TO CENTRAL LOCATIONS.

12) LET BOROUGH-WIDE PLANNING BOARDS DETERMINE THE LOCATIONS OF MAJOR PUBLIC FACILITIES AFTER OPEN HEARING AND DEBATE RATHER THAN LOCAL, DECENTRALIZED GROUPS WHOSE NEGATIVIST ATTITUDES AND PRESENT VETO-POWER STYMIE MORE AND MORE EFFECTIVE COMMUNITY ACTION.

13) MAKE MORE INNOVATIVE AND IMAGINATIVE USE OF MOVING SIDEWALKS, COMPUTER PROGRAMMED BUSES, EXPRESS BUSES, ETC. SO AS TO PERMIT "HIGH DENSITY WITHOUT CONGESTION", THROUGHOUT THE CENTRAL CITY.

14) PLAN PUBLIC HOUSING AND FACILITIES WITH "DEFENSIBLE SPACE" CONCEPT SO AS TO PREVENT "PRUITT-IGOE" SYNDROME.

15) TREAT OCCUPANCY IN PUBLIC HOUSING AS A "PRIVILEGE" NOT A "RIGHT" SO AS TO BE IN A POSITION TO ENFORCE HIGHER TENANT STANDARDS.

16) PROVIDE GOVERNMENT-SPONSORED "SMALL BUSINESS" ADVISORY SERVICES AND ALSO PROPERTY MAINTENANCE ADVISORY SERVICES FOR UNSOPHISTICATED PROPERTY OWNERS.

17) TURN OVER ABANDONED, VACANT HOUSES "AS IS" TO APPROVED "URBAN HOMESTEADERS" WHO WILL PUT IN "SWEAT EQUITY" IN REHABILITATION.

18) REQUIRE ARCHITECTS TO PUT VISIBLE IDENTIFICATION PLAQUES OR SIGNS ON ALL NEW CONSTRUCTION, SO THAT IN ADDITION TO BEING PROUD OF GOOD BUILDINGS THEY WILL BE ASHAMED OF UNINSPIRED ONES.

19) HAVE TAXIMETERS ADJUSTED TO 2 DIFFERENT FARE RATES, THE LOWER FOR SLACK HOURS AND THE HIGHER FOR RUSH HOURS, RAINY OR SNOWY DAYS, THEATRE HOUR, ETC.

20) INSTITUTE MAJOR FREE CHILD DAY CARE AND NURSERY SCHOOL PROGRAMS, WITH FREE TOYS, FREE HOT MEALS, ETC. SO AS TO PERMIT MOTHERS TO WORK AND ALSO TO PERMIT HEALTHIER, "PSYCHE-BUILDING" ATMOSPHERE FOR SLUM CHILD.

21) INSTITUTE IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS FREE PREVENTIVE MEDICINE PROGRAM PATTERNED AFTER ARMY "SICK-CALL".

22) LOWER "SCHOOL-LEAVING" AGE FOR THOSE WHO WISH IT, IF THEY WILL GO INTO VOCATIONAL TRAINING PROGRAMS.

Federal Programs

1) Nationalize (and equalize) welfare payments, so as to minimize population transfers for only that reason.

2) Waive federal minimum wage levels for adolescents so as to permit them to compete in the labor market.

3) Provide federal income tax deductions for tuition at private colleges and secondary schools.

State Programs

1) Transfer the burden of public education and all services to the poor from the local property tax to the state income tax.

2) Remove all subsidies from the automobile and apply to mass transit.

23) Expand and intensify "culture-bus"-type activities and events similar to those that Thomas Hoving used to bring people to the parks when he was Parks Commissioner.

24) Encourage the creation of more privately-sponsored or donated "Paley Park" type oases in the city.

25) Institute London-style "traffic boxes" at intersections on major thoroughfares, where auto traffic cannot enter the traffic box until exit is assured.

26) Sponsor steam-cleaning and night-illumination of major civic monuments and landmark buildings where not already done.

27) Explore possibilities of "Son et Lumière" type spectacles in New York where feasible.

28) Stimulate imaginative use of landmark buildings (such as the Old Customs House) as art galleries, exhibition space, public reading rooms, etc.

29) Support strongly the creation of the proposed new Convention Center, the monumental Portman hotel complex in Times Square, and similar enterprises that re-inforce the city's role as the prime exchange point for people, goods and ideas.

30) Create an Assembly of the city's major independent civic and eleemosynary organizations so that they can better coordinate their activities and also serve as a more visible, more vocal "constituency of the good guys".

31) Expand dramatically programs and facilities aimed at adolescents in deprived areas. The Police Athletic League's exciting new central Harlem facility, Phipps Center, for example, should be helped substantially and should be replicated many times throughout the city.

32) Street fairs, block parties and other ways of bringing life to the streets and of bringing people together should be encouraged.

33) Some places like New Orleans and Rio de Janeiro have their Mardi Gras or like Burgundy their "Trois Glorieuses", some like Munich their "Oktoberfest" or Meursault their "Paulée". Could New York create some sort of equivalent?

34) Restore the older, more effective concept of "equality of opportunity" in place of the currently faddish and harmful "equality of result".

35) Intensify recruitment efforts among minority groups for the police and fire departments.

36) In general, do <u>not</u> lower standards but through tutoring, guidance, "cram sessions" etc. help more people to <u>meet</u> them.

37) PROVIDE ACTIVE MATERIAL AND PSYCHOLOGICAL SUPPORT TO CONTINUE THE NEW YORK CITY-RAND INSTITUTE'S EFFECTIVE EFFORTS ON BEHALF OF THE CITY.

38) MOVE ALL PARADES TO WEEKENDS (AND POSSIBLY TO RIVERSIDE DRIVE AT THAT).

39) STRENGTHEN "SPECIAL" SCHOOLS LIKE BRONX SCIENCE, HUNTER, ETC. IN A FRANK RECOGNITION OF THE FACT THAT BRAINS AND TALENT ARE MAJOR NATIONAL (AND LOCAL) RESOURCES.

40) ASK THOSE WHO SNICKERINGLY OR INDIGNANTLY USE THE TERM "ELITEST" WHAT TEST SCORES, QUALIFICATIONS, ETC. THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE APPLIED TO THE MAN SCHEDULED TO PERFORM BRAIN SURGERY ON THEIR CHILD.

41) SPONSOR CITY-WIDE ESSAY CONTESTS, POSTER CONTESTS, DEBATING AND PUBLIC SPEAKING CONTESTS, ETC. TO ENCOURAGE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION; GIVE PRIZES AND PUBLICITY SO THAT EFFORT WILL BE ENCOURAGED AND MERIT RECOGNIZED.

42) STUDY THE THORNY BUT UNACKNOWLEDGED PROBLEM OF "TIPPING POINTS" (RACIAL, RELIGIOUS, ECONOMIC, SOCIAL, ETC.) FOR APPLICABILITY TO POLICIES INVOLVING PUBLIC HOUSING, GOVERNMENT EMPLOYMENT, ETC.

43) PROVIDE OPPORTUNITIES FOR OLDER RETIRED PEOPLE TO SERVE AS VOLUNTEERS IN MEANINGFUL CIVIC ACTIVITIES.

44) APPLY COST-BENEFIT RATIO TESTS TO INCREMENTAL CIVIC EXPENDITURES.

45) PROVIDE SPECIAL HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES FOR ELDERLY SINGLE WELFARE CASES.

46) RAISE THE LEVEL OF AMENITIES OF C.U.N.Y. COLLEGE FACILITIES TO THOSE OF PRIVATE UNIVERSITY STANDARDS, SO AS TO GET MUCH BETTER VALUE FROM PUBLIC FUNDS ALREADY BEING SPENT.